metals dominated this field. During this period his publications were many dating between 1930 (Phys. Rev. **36**, 1503) and 1966 (Phys. Rev. **152**, 498). These works provided the first reliable quantitative measurements as well as the formulation of the extraordinary (or anomalous) Hall effect which appears in ferromagnetic materials (third equation in Bergmann's article), and which, incidentally he named. Most important, his work also provides much of the data upon which any of the theories is based. For example, as far back as 1954 Karplus and Luttinger leaned heavily on Pugh's data in suggesting, correctly, that spin-orbit coupling is involved in the extraordinary Hall effect.

It is perhaps, natural that as former students of Pugh we are more cognizant than most of his many contributions to the current knowledge and understanding of the extraordinary Hall effect. Nevertheless, in view of the central role played by Pugh in the elucidation of this phenomena, we feel it is imperative that Bergmann's omission be called to the attention of your readers.

G. C. CARTER
National Research Council
A. C. EHRLICH
A. I. SCHLINDLER
10/3/79 *US Naval Research Laboratory*

THE AUTHOR COMMENTS: I am sorry that Schindler, Ehrlich and Carter are disturbed because the important work of Emerson Pugh is not referred to. However, my article was never planned as a review. (It had originally the title "The anomalous-Hall effect, a new and versatile measuring method," which was only changed by the editors in the final version for editorial reasons.) The goal of the article was to present the anomalous Hall effect as an interesting tool for the investigation of solid-state physics. Since the number of experimental and theoretical contributions to the anomalous Hall effect is almost uncountable, I referred to two surveys (ref. 4) and citated no experimental investigations (not even my own one). I restricted myself to a theoretical paper that gives an heuristic understanding of the effect and concentrates on the applications of the anomalous Hall effect as a tool for physics.

G. BERGMANN
Institut für Festkörperforschung
Jülich, West Germany

Wanted: papers on energy

The Forum on Physics and Society is organizing a *contributed* paper session on Physics and the Energy Crisis for the APS meeting in Washington, 21–24 April, 1980. We hope that this session will encourage many readers who have been considering the energy issues to come forward with an abstract so that they might share their ideas with the broader physics community. We are interested in all aspects of the energy problem; production/conservation, strategies, devices, environment, economics, and so on. We would encourage contributors to quantify their thoughts and results when possible, because they will be addressing an audience of physicists. The abstracts are due at the APS on 25 January 1980. We would appreciate it if a copy of the abstract could be sent to one of us (Hafemeister) so that we may have ample time to arrange the abstracts in some logical fashion.

DAVID HAFEMEISTER
California Polytechnic University
San Luis Obispo, California 93407
DIETRICH SCHROEER
University of North Carolina
10/11/79 *Chapel Hill, NC*

Poincare and Einstein

The letter by Henri Bacry (August, page 11) attributes to Einstein the idea that an atom that emits a photon undergoes a recoil. This idea predates Einstein at least to Poincare [Archives Neerlandaises des Sciences Exactes et Naturelles V, 252 (1900), page 260]. The latter wrote ". . . . si un appareil quelconque apres avoir produit de l'energie electromagnetique, l'envoie par rayonnement dans une certaine direction, cet appareil devra *reculer* comme recule un canon qui a lance un projectile." He also did calculations using the relation $mv = E/c$, where v is the recoil velocity of the emitter of mass m, E is the amount of electromagnetic energy emitted at velocity c.

Einstein was a nucleation center who brought together in a systematic way ideas that had been accumulating for decades, and in some cases centuries. When such a nucleation event occurs it becomes the new reference point, and the originators of the encompassed ideas tend to become lost in the mist of history. As an analogy one may compare the Hebraic, Christian and Islamic calendars and the corresponding views of what truths are attributed to whom.

GORDON R. FREEMAN
The University of Alberta
10/4/79 *Edmonton, Alberta, Canada*

THE AUTHOR COMMENTS: I have never attributed to Einstein the idea that an atom that emits an electromagnetic wave undergoes a recoil. Nevertheless, the concept of photon as a particle endowed with energy and momentum is due to Einstein.

HENRI BACRY
Faculte des Sciences de Luminy
11/9/79 *Marseille, France* □